

EXHIBIT 4

Vicky Romanenko

From: Esshaki, Gene J. <gjesshaki@abbottnicholson.com>
Sent: Friday, February 17, 2017 8:36 PM
To: Steve Williams; Vicky Romanenko
Cc: 'Jackie Taylor'; 'Emily Luthy'; 'Millicent Lundburg'; 'rlinkin@dwmrlaw.com'; 'Ian A. Kanig'; 'Hemlock, Adam'; 'Ronnie Spiegel'; Demetrius Lambrinos; 'AEllis@stblaw.com'; 'Patrick.Carome@wilmerhale.com'; 'Steven Cherry'; 'klein@butzel.com'; 'Asmedley@winston.com'; 'Novison, Heather'; 'Trey Nicoud'; 'JAmato@winston.com'; 'WShotzbarger@duanemorris.com'; 'heather.choi@bakerbotts.com'; 'Sloane Kuney Rosenthal'; Evelyn Li; 'Jill S. Casselman'; 'Bonk, Cameron'; 'Bradley Love'; 'Elliot.Weingarten@stblaw.com'; 'Justina K. Sessions'; 'Trager, Lara'; 'Ciolino Dawn L'; 'Daniel Purcell'; Raiter, Shawn; Burks, Laurie
Subject: RE: Honda Objection

I am the first position on this issue. If you do not concur in a joint position on a Confidentiality Approach then the matter must come before me in the first instance. How do Defendants want to proceed given this?

Sent from my Verizon, Samsung Galaxy smartphone

----- Original message -----

From: Steve Williams <SWilliams@cpmlegal.com>
Date: 2/17/17 7:09 PM (GMT-05:00)
To: 'Esshaki, Gene J.' <gjesshaki@abbottnicholson.com>, Vicky Romanenko <Vicky@cuneolaw.com>
Cc: 'Jackie Taylor' <jtaylor@dbcllp.com>, 'Emily Luthy' <Eluthy@dbcllp.com>, 'Millicent Lundburg' <mlundburg@dbcllp.com>, "'rlinkin@dwmrlaw.com'" <rlinkin@dwmrlaw.com>, "'Ian A. Kanig'" <IKanig@kvn.com>, "'Hemlock, Adam'" <adam.hemlock@weil.com>, 'Ronnie Spiegel' <ronnie@hbsslaw.com>, Demetrius Lambrinos <DLambrinos@cpmlegal.com>, "'AEllis@stblaw.com'" <AEllis@stblaw.com>, "'Patrick.Carome@wilmerhale.com'" <Patrick.Carome@wilmerhale.com>, 'Steven Cherry' <Steven.Cherry@wilmerhale.com>, "'klein@butzel.com'" <klein@butzel.com>, "'Asmedley@winston.com'" <Asmedley@winston.com>, "'Novison, Heather'" <Heather.Novison@weil.com>, 'Trey Nicoud' <TNicoud@gibsondunn.com>, "'JAmato@winston.com'" <JAmato@winston.com>, "'WShotzbarger@duanemorris.com'" <WShotzbarger@duanemorris.com>, "'heather.choi@bakerbotts.com'" <heather.choi@bakerbotts.com>, 'Sloane Kuney Rosenthal' <SRosenthal@gibsondunn.com>, Evelyn Li <evelyn@cuneolaw.com>, "'Jill S. Casselman'" <JCasselman@RobinsKaplan.com>, "'Bonk, Cameron'" <Cameron.Bonk@weil.com>, 'Bradley Love' <Bradley.Love@btlaw.com>, "'Elliot.Weingarten@stblaw.com'" <Elliot.Weingarten@stblaw.com>, "'Justina K. Sessions'" <JSessions@kvn.com>, "'Trager, Lara'" <Lara.Trager@weil.com>, 'Ciolino Dawn L.' <dlciolino@abbottnicholson.com>, 'Daniel Purcell' <DPurcell@KVN.com>, 'Raiter, Shawn' <sraiter@larsonking.com>, 'Burks, Laurie' <lburks@larsonking.com>
Subject: RE: Honda Objection

Your Honor

On consideration, End-Payors do not believe that this will resolve the issue. While it is true that some of the materials that are at issue may be subject to designations of confidentiality, we do not believe that the Court or the Parties should be advising these four automotive dealers that the information at issue will, for all time, be subject to the highest level

of protection under the Protective Order and never be part of any court filing. The Protective Order sets forth how things produced in discovery may be designated, while *Shane Group, Inc. v. Blue Cross Blue Shield of Michigan*, 825 F.3d 299 (6th Cir. 2016) governs the standards applicable to sealing court records. *Shane* sets forth very strict limitations on sealing court files, particularly in class actions. While it might be true that none of the matters at issue in the objections that these four automotive dealers have made will ever be filed publicly, in End-Payor's view this is not a certainty and we would be either (1) misleading these four automotive dealers by making the representations suggested below or (2) unfairly and prejudicially restricting the parties' ability to use the materials at issue in this litigation if such a commitment were made to these four automotive dealers.

End-Payors continue to believe that the appropriate manner of dealing with this issue is by having End-Payors and Defendants file their responses to the four automotive dealer's objections to Your Honor's Orders so that Judge Battani can resolve those objections.

From: Esshaki, Gene J. [mailto:gjesshaki@abbottnicholson.com]

Sent: Friday, February 17, 2017 10:40 AM

To: Vicky Romanenko <Vicky@cuneolaw.com>

Cc: 'Jackie Taylor' <jtaylor@dbcllp.com>; 'Emily Luthy' <Eluthy@dbcllp.com>; 'Millicent Lundburg' <mlundburg@dbcllp.com>; 'rlinkin@dwmrlaw.com' <rlinkin@dwmrlaw.com>; 'Ian A. Kanig' <IKanig@kvn.com>; 'Hemlock, Adam' <adam.hemlock@weil.com>; 'Ronnie Spiegel' <ronnie@hbsslaw.com>; Demetrius Lambrinos <DLambrinos@cpmlegal.com>; Steve Williams <SWilliams@cpmlegal.com>; 'AEllis@stblaw.com' <AEllis@stblaw.com>; 'Patrick.Carome@wilmerhale.com' <Patrick.Carome@wilmerhale.com>; 'Steven Cherry' <Steven.Cherry@wilmerhale.com>; 'klein@butzel.com' <klein@butzel.com>; 'Asmedley@winston.com' <Asmedley@winston.com>; 'Novison, Heather' <Heather.Novison@weil.com>; 'Trey Nicoud' <TNicoud@gibsondunn.com>; 'JAmato@winston.com' <JAmato@winston.com>; 'WShotzbarger@duanemorris.com' <WShotzbarger@duanemorris.com>; 'heather.choi@bakerbotts.com' <heather.choi@bakerbotts.com>; 'Sloane Kuney Rosenthal' <SRosenthal@gibsondunn.com>; Evelyn Li <evelyn@cuneolaw.com>; 'Jill S. Casselman' <JCasselman@RobinsKaplan.com>; 'Bonk, Cameron' <Cameron.Bonk@weil.com>; 'Bradley Love' <Bradley.Love@btlaw.com>; 'Elliot.Weingarten@stblaw.com' <Elliot.Weingarten@stblaw.com>; 'Justina K. Sessions' <JSessions@kvn.com>; 'Trager, Lara' <Lara.Trager@weil.com>; Ciolino Dawn L. <dlciolino@abbottnicholson.com>; 'Daniel Purcell' <DPurcell@KVN.com>; Raiter, Shawn <sraiter@larsonking.com>; Burks, Laurie <lburks@larsonking.com>
Subject: RE: Honda Objection

I concur in this suggestion as to Antonio. Please implement as soon as possible.

Gene J. Esshaki



Abbott, Nicholson, Quilter, Esshaki & Youngblood, P.C.
 300 River Place, Suite 3000
 Detroit, MI 48207-4225
 TEL: 313.566.2500
 FAX: 313.566.2502

www.abbottnicholson.com

INFORMATION CONTAINED IN THIS E-MAIL TRANSMISSION IS ATTORNEY-CLIENT COMMUNICATIONS AND IS PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL. **THE PRIVILEGE MAY BE LOST IF YOU FORWARD OR DISCLOSE IT TO THIRD PARTIES.** PLEASE EXERCISE DUE CARE. IF YOU ARE NOT THE INTENDED RECIPIENT, DO NOT READ, DISTRIBUTE OR REPRODUCE THIS TRANSMISSION (INCLUDING ANY ATTACHMENTS). IF YOU HAVE RECEIVED THIS E-MAIL IN ERROR, PLEASE NOTIFY THE SENDER BY E-MAIL REPLY. WHEN IN DOUBT, PLEASE CONTACT ME.

We are not authorized to enter into any binding agreement on behalf of any of our clients. If this communication contains any settlement proposal, it is for discussion purposes only and does not constitute an offer on behalf of us or any of our clients, and cannot create a contract or legally binding agreement. Any settlement of any matter requires the signature of an authorized representative of our client (other than Abbott Nicholson, P.C.) on final definitive documents which have been approved in accordance with our client's procedures.

From: Vicky Romanenko [<mailto:Vicky@cuneolaw.com>]

Sent: Friday, February 17, 2017 1:35 PM

To: Esshaki, Gene J.

Cc: 'Jackie Taylor'; 'Emily Luthy'; 'Millicent Lundburg'; 'rlinkin@dwmrlaw.com'; 'Ian A. Kanig'; 'Hemlock, Adam'; 'Ronnie Spiegel'; 'Demetrius Lambrinos'; 'Steve Williams'; 'AEllis@stblaw.com'; 'Patrick.Carome@wilmerhale.com'; 'Steven Cherry'; 'klein@butzel.com'; 'Asmedley@winston.com'; 'Novison, Heather'; 'Trey Nicoud'; 'JAmato@winston.com'; 'WShotzbarger@duanemorris.com'; 'heather.choi@bakerbotts.com'; 'Sloane Kuney Rosenthal'; Evelyn Li; 'Jill S. Casselman'; 'Bonk, Cameron'; 'Bradley Love'; 'Elliot.Weingarten@stblaw.com'; 'Justina K. Sessions'; 'Trager, Lara'; Ciolino Dawn L.; 'Daniel Purcell'; Raiter, Shawn; Burks, Laurie

Subject: RE: Honda Objection

Your Honor,

Based on the objections, we understand that Highly Confidential treatment will satisfy Earnhardt, Waikem and Turner, who have already stated what concerns them is public disclosure of their information and disclosure to other dealerships and/or consumers. We believe that is sufficient for them and nothing further is needed.

That leaves Antonino, who appears to have objected completely. We would suggest a letter to Antonino stating that the data will be produced as Highly Confidential and not made public. We suggest that such a letter come from all Serving Parties.

From: Esshaki, Gene J. [<mailto:gjesshaki@abbottnicholson.com>]

Sent: Friday, February 17, 2017 1:29 PM

To: Vicky Romanenko

Cc: 'Jackie Taylor'; 'Emily Luthy'; 'Millicent Lundburg'; 'rlinkin@dwmrlaw.com'; 'Ian A. Kanig'; 'Hemlock, Adam'; 'Ronnie Spiegel'; 'Demetrius Lambrinos'; 'Steve Williams'; 'AEllis@stblaw.com'; 'Patrick.Carome@wilmerhale.com'; 'Steven Cherry'; 'klein@butzel.com'; 'Asmedley@winston.com'; 'Novison, Heather'; 'Trey Nicoud'; 'JAmato@winston.com'; 'WShotzbarger@duanemorris.com'; 'heather.choi@bakerbotts.com'; 'Sloane Kuney Rosenthal'; Evelyn Li; 'Jill S. Casselman'; 'Bonk, Cameron'; 'Bradley Love'; 'Elliot.Weingarten@stblaw.com'; 'Justina K. Sessions'; 'Trager, Lara'; Ciolino Dawn L.; 'Daniel Purcell'; Raiter, Shawn; Burks, Laurie

Subject: RE: Honda Objection

I suggest that Plaintiffs and Defendants jointly approach the objecting dealers and indicate that the previously issued protective order will extend to the information requested and see if this is sufficient for the dealers to produce. See Statement Concerning Earnhardt Objection Docket No.1647.

Gene J. Esshaki



Abbott, Nicholson, Quilter, Esshaki & Youngblood, P.C.

300 River Place, Suite 3000

Detroit, MI 48207-4225

TEL: 313.566.2500

FAX: 313.566.2502

www.abbottnicholson.com

INFORMATION CONTAINED IN THIS E-MAIL TRANSMISSION IS ATTORNEY-CLIENT COMMUNICATIONS AND IS PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL. **THE PRIVILEGE MAY BE LOST IF YOU FORWARD OR DISCLOSE IT TO THIRD PARTIES.** PLEASE EXERCISE DUE CARE. IF YOU ARE NOT THE INTENDED RECIPIENT, DO NOT READ, DISTRIBUTE OR REPRODUCE THIS TRANSMISSION (INCLUDING ANY ATTACHMENTS). IF YOU HAVE RECEIVED THIS E-MAIL IN ERROR, PLEASE NOTIFY THE SENDER BY E-MAIL REPLY. WHEN IN DOUBT, PLEASE CONTACT ME.

We are not authorized to enter into any binding agreement on behalf of any of our clients. If this communication contains any settlement proposal, it is for discussion purposes only and does not constitute an offer on behalf of us or any of our clients, and cannot create a contract or legally binding agreement. Any settlement of any matter requires the signature of an authorized representative of our client (other than Abbott Nicholson, P.C.) on final definitive documents which have been approved in accordance with our client's procedures.

From: Vicky Romanenko [<mailto:Vicky@cuneolaw.com>]

Sent: Friday, February 17, 2017 12:26 PM

To: Esshaki, Gene J.

Cc: 'Jackie Taylor'; 'Emily Luthy'; 'Millicent Lundburg'; 'rlinkin@dwmrlaw.com'; 'Ian A. Kanig'; 'Hemlock, Adam'; 'Ronnie Spiegel'; 'Demetrius Lambrinos'; 'Steve Williams'; 'AEllis@stblaw.com'; 'Patrick.Carome@wilmerhale.com'; 'Steven Cherry'; 'klein@butzel.com'; 'Asmedley@winston.com'; 'Novison, Heather'; 'Trey Nicoud'; 'JAmato@winston.com'; 'WShotzbarger@duanemorris.com'; 'heather.choi@bakerbotts.com'; 'Sloane Kuney Rosenthal'; Evelyn Li; 'Jill S. Casselman'; 'Bonk, Cameron'; 'Bradley Love'; 'Elliot.Weingarten@stblaw.com'; 'Justina K. Sessions'; 'Trager, Lara'; Ciolino Dawn L.; 'Daniel Purcell'; Raiter, Shawn; Burks, Laurie

Subject: RE: Honda Objection

Dear Special Master Esshaki,

We had an exchange on Monday regarding the third-party Honda dealers' objections, but we have not heard from End-Payers and Defendants since then. On Tuesday, End-Payers and Defendants filed a statement with the Court indicating that they would file their responses to the third-party dealers' letters with the Court.

We do not agree that these objections are before the Court. Your Honor has not yet issued a ruling on them. These dealers' objections are before Your Honor for the first time and are thus not yet ready for an appeal to the Judge. The Court's function, under the Order Appointing a Master, is to review Your Honor's orders. But for an order to be ripe for review, it must first be entered by Your Honor. The provision in the Order Appointing a Master contemplates review by the Court solely as an appellate function, meaning that the Court does not opine on a discovery issue until Your Honor has done so. Given that Your Honor has not stated your views on these third-party dealers' letters, the Court cannot

make a determination regarding Your Honor's decision about them under Fed. R. Civ. P. 53(f), and, in turn, the Order Appointing a Master.

From: Esshaki, Gene J. [<mailto:gjesshaki@abbottnicholson.com>]

Sent: Monday, February 13, 2017 1:28 PM

To: Vicky Romanenko

Cc: 'Jackie Taylor'; 'Emily Luthy'; 'Millicent Lundburg'; 'rlinkin@dwmrlaw.com'; 'Ian A. Kanig'; 'Hemlock, Adam'; 'Ronnie Spiegel'; 'Demetrius Lambrinos'; 'Steve Williams'; 'AEllis@stblaw.com'; 'Patrick.Carome@wilmerhale.com'; 'Steven Cherry'; 'klein@butzel.com'; 'Asmedley@winston.com'; 'Novison, Heather'; 'Trey Nicoud'; 'JAmato@winston.com'; 'WShotzbarger@duanemorris.com'; 'heather.choi@bakerbotts.com'; 'Sloane Kuney Rosenthal'; Evelyn Li; 'Jill S. Casselman'; 'Bonk, Cameron'; 'Bradley Love'; 'Elliot.Weingarten@stblaw.com'; 'Justina K. Sessions'; 'Trager, Lara'; Ciolino Dawn L.; 'Daniel Purcell'; Raiter, Shawn; Burks, Laurie

Subject: RE: Honda Objection

Can the parties work out a stipulated order to address the concerns of these third party dealers as suggested by Ms. Romanenko?

Gene J. Esshaki



Abbott, Nicholson, Quilter, Esshaki & Youngblood, P.C.

300 River Place, Suite 3000

Detroit, MI 48207-4225

TEL: 313.566.2500

FAX: 313.566.2502

www.abbottnicholson.com

INFORMATION CONTAINED IN THIS E-MAIL TRANSMISSION IS ATTORNEY-CLIENT COMMUNICATIONS AND IS PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL. **THE PRIVILEGE MAY BE LOST IF YOU FORWARD OR DISCLOSE IT TO THIRD PARTIES.** PLEASE EXERCISE DUE CARE. IF YOU ARE NOT THE INTENDED RECIPIENT, DO NOT READ, DISTRIBUTE OR REPRODUCE THIS TRANSMISSION (INCLUDING ANY ATTACHMENTS). IF YOU HAVE RECEIVED THIS E-MAIL IN ERROR, PLEASE NOTIFY THE SENDER BY E-MAIL REPLY. WHEN IN DOUBT, PLEASE CONTACT ME.

We are not authorized to enter into any binding agreement on behalf of any of our clients. If this communication contains any settlement proposal, it is for discussion purposes only and does not constitute an offer on behalf of us or any of our clients, and cannot create a contract or legally binding agreement. Any settlement of any matter requires the signature of an authorized representative of our client (other than Abbott Nicholson, P.C.) on final definitive documents which have been approved in accordance with our client's procedures.

From: Vicky Romanenko [<mailto:Vicky@cuneolaw.com>]

Sent: Monday, February 13, 2017 12:33 PM

To: Esshaki, Gene J.

Cc: 'Jackie Taylor'; 'Emily Luthy'; 'Millicent Lundburg'; 'rlinkin@dwmrlaw.com'; 'Ian A. Kanig'; 'Hemlock, Adam'; 'Ronnie Spiegel'; 'Demetrius Lambrinos'; 'Steve Williams'; 'AEllis@stblaw.com'; 'Patrick.Carome@wilmerhale.com'; 'Steven Cherry'; 'klein@butzel.com'; 'Asmedley@winston.com'; 'Novison, Heather'; 'Trey Nicoud'; 'JAmato@winston.com'; 'WShotzbarger@duanemorris.com'; 'heather.choi@bakerbotts.com'; 'Sloane Kuney Rosenthal'; Evelyn Li; 'Jill S. Casselman'; 'Bonk, Cameron'; 'Bradley Love'; 'Elliot.Weingarten@stblaw.com'; 'Justina K. Sessions'; 'Trager, Lara'; 'Ciolino Dawn L.'; 'Daniel Purcell'; Raiter, Shawn; Burks, Laurie
Subject: RE: Honda Objection

Dear Special Master Esshaki,

Re-attached to this email are the automobile dealership objections from third-party dealerships, to the production by Honda of Honda dealers' DMS data. We believe that these dealerships' concerns should be taken into account.

We believe that these dealers' data, if produced, should be ordered to be treated as Highly Confidential under the protective order, filed under seal, not provided to anyone outside the litigation, not used outside the litigation, and not shown to any other dealerships.

From: Burks, Laurie [<mailto:lburks@larsonking.com>]

Sent: Monday, January 30, 2017 1:11 PM

To: 'gjesshaki@abbottnicholson.com'

Cc: 'Jackie Taylor'; 'Emily Luthy'; 'Millicent Lundburg'; 'rlinkin@dwmrlaw.com'; 'Ian A. Kanig'; 'Hemlock, Adam'; 'Ronnie Spiegel'; 'Demetrius Lambrinos'; 'Steve Williams'; 'AEllis@stblaw.com'; 'Patrick.Carome@wilmerhale.com'; 'Steven Cherry'; 'klein@butzel.com'; 'Asmedley@winston.com'; 'Novison, Heather'; 'Trey Nicoud'; 'JAmato@winston.com'; 'WShotzbarger@duanemorris.com'; 'heather.choi@bakerbotts.com'; 'Sloane Kuney Rosenthal'; Evelyn Li; Vicky Romanenko; 'Jill S. Casselman'; 'Bonk, Cameron'; 'Bradley Love'; 'Elliot.Weingarten@stblaw.com'; 'Justina K. Sessions'; 'Trager, Lara'; 'Ciolino Dawn L.'; 'Daniel Purcell'; Raiter, Shawn

Subject: Honda Objection

Dear Special Master Esshaki:

Enclosed you will find communication we received from the Waikem Honda dealer. We will file this via ECF in the MDL master file.

Best regards,

Shawn

SHAWN M. RAITER

vCard

Bio

Web

Larson • King, LLP

30 East Seventh Street • Suite 2800

St. Paul, MN 55101

Direct: 651-312-6518

Fax: 651-789-4818

LARSONKING.COM

LARSON • KING
LITIGATION REDEFINED

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE:

This communication constitutes an electronic communication within the meaning of the Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 USC 2510, and its disclosure is strictly limited to the recipient intended by the sender of this message. This communication and any files transmitted with it may contain confidential and privileged material for the sole use of the intended recipient, including confidential attorney client communications and/or attorney work product. Receipt by anyone other than the intended recipient is not intended to and does not constitute a loss of the confidential or privileged nature of the communications. Any review or distribution by others is strictly prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient you must not read, use, copy, retransmit or disseminate this

communication and you are directed to immediately notify the sender by return electronic mail and delete all copies of this communication. To reply to our email directly, send an email to: sraiter@larsonking.com

The information contained in this message may be attorney-client or work-product privileged and should be treated as confidential information intended only for the use of the individual or entity named above. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please immediately notify us by return e-mail, destroying the original message and any copies.

The information contained in this message may be attorney-client or work-product privileged and should be treated as confidential information intended only for the use of the individual or entity named above. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please immediately notify us by return e-mail, destroying the original message and any copies.

The information contained in this message may be attorney-client or work-product privileged and should be treated as confidential information intended only for the use of the individual or entity named above. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please immediately notify us by return e-mail, destroying the original message and any copies.